



Innovative approaches  
Practical results  
Outstanding service

9601 McAllister Fwy, Suite 1008 • San Antonio, Texas 78216 • 210-298-3800 • FAX 210-298-3801

[www.freese.com](http://www.freese.com)

October 6, 2017

Sean Reich P.E., PMP  
City Engineer  
402 E. Blanco  
Boerne, TX 78006

Subject: Recommendation of Construction Contract Award for Richter Ave. Water Main Repl. & Oak Park Dr. Sewer Main Replacement Project

Dear Mr. Reich:

Bids for the above referenced project were opened by the City of Boerne on September 28, 2017 at 10:00 am. The bid tabulation, compiled by Freese and Nichols, Inc. (FNI), indicated that three companies submitted bids for the project. The companies are listed below in order of lowest bid to highest bid:

- M5 Utilities, LLC
- Coppera, LLC
- Black Castle General Contractor, LLC

FNI reviewed the bid tabulation for inconsistencies, balance of unit prices and mathematical errors. The bids ranged from \$375,739 to \$496,882.90. The average Total Bid Amount was \$438,707.37 and the Engineer's Estimate for the project was \$380,300.

M5 Utilities, LLC. was the apparent low bidder with a Total Bid Amount of \$375,739. Coppera, LLC was the apparent second low bidder with a Total Bid Amount of \$443,500.20. There were mathematical errors found with the high bidder (Black Castle) where the sum of the extended amounts is \$849.10 less than the \$497,732.00 amount written in the Total Bid Amount on the Bid Form. The error on the Black Castle Bid Form did not change the outcome of the bids received. The M5 Utilities, LLC bid is approximately 18% less than the second lowest bid and it is approximately 1% less than the Engineer's Estimate.

Based upon FNI's review of the references submitted by M5 Utilities, LLC., and review of the bid tabulation, the Contractor appears to be capable of performing the work on this project. As a result, FNI recommends that the Award of Contract for the Richter Ave. Water Main Replacement and Oak Park Dr. Sewer Main Replacement be granted to M5 Utilities, LLC.

If you have any questions concerning this recommendation please call (210) 298-3829 at your convenience.

Sincerely,

Freese and Nichols, Inc.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'David T. Bennett'.

David T. Bennett, P.E., Project Manager

cc: Ryan Bass, City of Boerne

Attachments: Bid Tabulation; Contractor Reference

CLIENT: CITY OF BORENE  
PROJECT: RICHTER AVE WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT AND OAK PARK DRIVE SEWER MAIN REPLACEMENT  
ENGINEER: FREESE AND NICHOLS, INC.

PROJECT # BOR16639  
BID DATE: 9/28/2017

				M5		COPPERA		BLACK CASTLE	
Item No.	Description	Unit	Estimated Quantity	Unit Price	Extended Amount	Unit Price	Extended Amount	Unit Price	Extended Amount
WATER									
1	MOBILIZATION/DEMOBILIZATION (MAX OF 5% OF BID ITEMS 3 - 20)	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$24,637.00	\$24,637.00
2	PREPARATION OF RIGHT-OF-WAY (MAX OF 3% OF BID ITEMS 3 - 20)	LS	1	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$4,200.00	\$4,200.00	\$4,133.00	\$4,133.00
3	EROSION AND SEDIMENTATION CONTROLS (SWPPP)	LS	1	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$1,580.00	\$1,580.00
4	TRAFFIC CONTROL (INCLUDING ALL BARRICADES, SIGNS, ETC.)	LS	1	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$5,900.00	\$5,900.00	\$24,378.00	\$24,378.00
5	TRENCH EXCAVATION SAFETY PROTECTION	LF	1110	\$3.00	\$3,330.00	\$60.00	\$66,600.00	\$1.00	\$1,110.00
6	8" PVC WATER MAIN, REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING MAIN, C900, DR-14	LF	1110	\$98.00	\$108,780.00	\$40.00	\$44,400.00	\$113.00	\$125,430.00
7	8" GATE VALVE	EA	5	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$1,888.00	\$9,440.00
8	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING FIRE HYDRANT AND GATE VALVE ASSEMBLY	EA	1	\$6,500.00	\$6,500.00	\$4,200.00	\$4,200.00	\$4,879.00	\$4,879.00
9	3/4" WATER SERVICE LINE, REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING SERVICE	LF	435	\$43.00	\$18,705.00	\$23.00	\$10,005.00	\$54.00	\$23,490.00
10	3/4" WATER SERVICE, REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING SERVICE BOX & RECONNECT METER	EA	17	\$1,100.00	\$18,700.00	\$440.00	\$7,480.00	\$749.00	\$12,733.00
11	DI WATER MAIN FITTINGS	TON	0.7	\$4,000.00	\$2,800.00	\$5,606.00	\$3,924.20	\$6,647.00	\$4,652.90
12	TIE-IN TO EXISTING WATER MAIN (STA 1+00)	EA	1	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$3,424.00	\$3,424.00
13	8" x 8" TAPPING SLEEVE AND VALVE (STA 12+10)	EA	1	\$1,100.00	\$1,100.00	\$4,200.00	\$4,200.00	\$6,444.00	\$6,444.00
14	16" STEEL CASING PIPE	LF	20	\$175.00	\$3,500.00	\$110.00	\$2,200.00	\$135.00	\$2,700.00
15	TRACER WIRE LOCATE BOX (WATER MAINS)	EA	1	\$575.00	\$575.00	\$750.00	\$750.00	\$1,726.00	\$1,726.00
16	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	795	\$50.00	\$39,750.00	\$100.00	\$79,500.00	\$71.00	\$56,445.00
17	CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER REPAIR	LF	12	\$17.00	\$204.00	\$85.00	\$1,020.00	\$71.00	\$852.00
18	CONCRETE SIDEWALK AND DRIVEWAY REPAIR	SY	9	\$45.00	\$405.00	\$180.00	\$1,620.00	\$142.00	\$1,278.00
19	GRAVEL DRIVEWAY REPAIR	SY	17	\$35.00	\$595.00	\$210.00	\$3,570.00	\$36.00	\$612.00
20	SODDING	SY	85	\$10.00	\$850.00	\$10.00	\$850.00	\$13.00	\$1,105.00
21	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING FENCE AND GATE	LF	24	\$50.00	\$1,200.00	\$150.00	\$3,600.00	\$57.00	\$1,368.00
	TOTAL BID AMOUNT WATER =				\$237,494.00		\$263,519.20		\$312,416.90
SANITARY SEWER									
1	MOBILIZATION/DEMOBILIZATION (MAX OF 5% OF BID ITEMS 3 - 15)	LS	1	5,000.00	\$5,000.00	5,500.00	\$5,500.00	11,128.00	\$11,128.00
2	PREPARATION OF RIGHT-OF-WAY (MAX OF 3% OF BID ITEMS 3 - 15)	LS	1	3,000.00	\$3,000.00	2,500.00	\$2,500.00	3,424.00	\$3,424.00
3	EROSION AND SEDIMENTATION CONTROLS (SWPPP)	LS	1	8,500.00	\$8,500.00	1,000.00	\$1,000.00	3,560.00	\$3,560.00
4	TRAFFIC CONTROL (INCLUDING ALL BARRICADES, SIGNS, ETC.)	LS	1	17,000.00	\$17,000.00	4,100.00	\$4,100.00	9,768.00	\$9,768.00
5	TRENCH EXCAVATION SAFETY PROTECTION	LF	450	3.00	\$1,350.00	90.00	\$40,500.00	3.00	\$1,350.00
6	35 (ALL DEPTHS)	LF	450	97.00	\$43,650.00	52.00	\$23,400.00	135.00	\$60,750.00
7	D3034, SDR-35	LF	350	75.00	\$26,250.00	102.96	\$36,036.00	118.00	\$41,300.00
8	6" SANITARY SEWER CLEANOUT	EA	10	175.00	\$1,750.00	850.00	\$8,500.00	1,039.00	\$10,390.00
9	ENCASEMENT)	EA	1	2,400.00	\$2,400.00	2,500.00	\$2,500.00	2,029.00	\$2,029.00
10	SANITARY SEWER TELEVISION	LF	450	5.50	\$2,475.00	10.00	\$4,500.00	7.00	\$3,150.00
11	ASPHALT PAVEMENT AND DRIVEWAY REPAIR	SY	444	50.00	\$22,200.00	100.00	\$44,400.00	71.00	\$31,524.00
12	CONCRETE CURB AND GUTTER REPAIR	LF	45	40.00	\$1,800.00	85.00	\$3,825.00	71.00	\$3,195.00
13	CONCRETE SIDEWALK AND DRIVEWAY REPAIR	SY	14	80.00	\$1,120.00	180.00	\$2,520.00	142.00	\$1,988.00
14	SODDING	SY	70	25.00	\$1,750.00	10.00	\$700.00	13.00	\$910.00
	TOTAL BID AMOUNT SEWER =				\$138,245.00		\$179,981.00		\$184,466.00
TOTAL BID AMOUNT WATER + SEWER =									
	TOTAL BID AMOUNT WATER + SEWER =				\$375,739.00		\$443,500.20		\$496,882.90

<b>Owner:</b>	<u>City of Boerne</u>	<b>Person Contacted:</b>	<u>Edgar Munoz P.E.</u>
<b>Project Name:</b>	<u>Richter Ave. Sewer Main Replacement</u>	<b>Telephone No.:</b>	<u>830-249-0600</u>
<b>Project No.:</b>	<u>BOR16639</u>	<b>Date   Time:</b>	<u>10/4/17- 1000</u>
<b>Contacted By:</b>	<u>David Marotta</u>	<b>Representing:</b>	<u>FNI</u>

**Reference Project:** Segment A Pipeline

**Project Description:** 10 miles of 16" potable water line.

**Project Complete:** ☐ Yes ☒ No    **On Schedule:** ☒ Yes ☐ No    **Completion Date:** November 2017

**Project Manager:** Jim Crawford

**Superintendent(s):** Lucas Webb

*E = Excellent*
*G = Good*
*F = Fair*
*P = Poor*
**Rate the Manager in the following categories:**

Qualifications by experience or skills	<u>G</u>	Professional conduct and integrity	<u>G</u>
Ability to manage subcontractors	<u>G</u>	Ability to work with changes	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Superintendent in the following categories:**

Qualifications by experience or skills	<u>G</u>	Professional conduct and integrity	<u>G</u>
Ability to manage subcontractors	<u>G</u>	Ability to work with changes	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's work habits and quality of the work performed:**

Rate overall quality of finished project	<u>          </u>	Significant rework required	<u>          </u>
Defective work corrected promptly	<u>          </u>	Quality control procedures adequate	<u>          </u>

Comments: Project is currently under construction but Mr. Munoz stated the project was being constructed in a quality manner.

**Rate the Contractor's project resources in the following categories:**

Adequate and skilled foreman	<u>G</u>	Equipment quantity and condition	<u>G</u>
Adequate and skilled labor force	<u>G</u>	Appropriate use of equipment	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's financial management and strength:**

Financial resources adequate for project	<u>G</u>	Liens by subcontractors or suppliers	<u>G</u>
Personnel wage disputes	<u>          </u>	Complaints of late or non-payment	<u>          </u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's ability to complete and follow-up on warranty work:**

Punchlist completed in reasonable time	<u>          </u>	Project staffed for timely completion	<u>          </u>
Response on warranty work acceptable	<u>          </u>	Did Owner perform any warranty work?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Comments: Project is still under construction.

**Would you recommend award of another contract to this Contractor?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

Comments or recommendations you would make to another owner:

<b>Owner:</b>	<u>City of Boerne</u>	<b>Person Contacted:</b>	<u>Stan Scott</u>
<b>Project Name:</b>	<u>Richter Ave. Sewer Main Replacement</u>	<b>Telephone No.:</b>	<u>830-537-5755</u>
<b>Project No.:</b>	<u>BOR16639</u>	<b>Date   Time:</b>	<u>10/3/17- 1400</u>
<b>Contacted By:</b>	<u>David Marotta</u>	<b>Representing:</b>	<u>FNI</u>

<b>Reference Project:</b>	<u>Segment A Pipeline</u>		
<b>Project Description:</b>	<u>10 miles of 16" water line</u>		
<b>Project Complete:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<b>On Schedule:</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
		<b>Completion Date:</b>	<u>November 2017</u>
<b>Project Manager:</b>	<u>Jim Crawford</u>		
<b>Superintendent(s):</b>	<u>Lucas Webb</u>		

*E = Excellent*
*G = Good*
*F = Fair*
*P = Poor*
**Rate the Manager in the following categories:**

Qualifications by experience or skills	<u>G</u>	Professional conduct and integrity	<u>G</u>
Ability to manage subcontractors	<u>G</u>	Ability to work with changes	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Superintendent in the following categories:**

Qualifications by experience or skills	<u>G</u>	Professional conduct and integrity	<u>G</u>
Ability to manage subcontractors	<u>G</u>	Ability to work with changes	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's work habits and quality of the work performed:**

Rate overall quality of finished project	<u>          </u>	Significant rework required	<u>          </u>
Defective work corrected promptly	<u>          </u>	Quality control procedures adequate	<u>          </u>

Comments: Project is still under construction but Mr. Scott stated project was being built in a quality manner.

**Rate the Contractor's project resources in the following categories:**

Adequate and skilled foreman	<u>G</u>	Equipment quantity and condition	<u>G</u>
Adequate and skilled labor force	<u>G</u>	Appropriate use of equipment	<u>G</u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's financial management and strength:**

Financial resources adequate for project	<u>G</u>	Liens by subcontractors or suppliers	<u>G</u>
Personnel wage disputes	<u>          </u>	Complaints of late or non-payment	<u>          </u>

Comments:

**Rate the Contractor's ability to complete and follow-up on warranty work:**

Punchlist completed in reasonable time	<u>          </u>	Project staffed for timely completion	<u>          </u>
Response on warranty work acceptable	<u>          </u>	Did Owner perform any warranty work?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Comments: Project is still under construction.

**Would you recommend award of another contract to this Contractor?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

Comments or recommendations you would make to another owner: