



AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

Agenda Date	March 5, 2024
Requested Action	Approve a request for a certificate of appropriateness, for a proposed building addition located at 410 N Main St (Saint Helena's Episcopal Church).
Contact Person	Sara Varvarigos, Planner II (830) 248-1630, svarvarigos@boerne-tx.gov
Background Information	HLC Case number: 2024-03-05D
	Contribution/ Integrity: Contributing/High
	Related case numbers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2023-06-008 – Windows • 2023-06-009 – Door • 2021-09-012 – Post and Panel Sign • 2021-09-011 – Post and Panel Sign • 2021-09-010 – Post and Panel Sign
	<p>BACKGROUND:</p> <p>The property located at 410 N Main St was previously replatted as a single lot, bounded by N Main St, Johns Rd, Live Oak St, and Rock St. Several existing structures located on the property:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A historic “Gothic Revival Style” Saint Helena Episcopal Church Sanctuary, built in 1930 (front elevation on North Main St, northwest elevation on Rock St) (Attachments 3&4) • Saint Helena's Episcopal School (Saint Helena's Wendler Hall) (front elevation on John's Rd, northeast elevation on North Main St) • Several accessory buildings that can be accessed along Live Oak St and Rock St <p>The property has 1 base zoning category (C2 – Transitional Commercial), and falls within the Historic District Overlay. (Attachment 1)</p> <p>This base zoning overlay district combination results in the following standards:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The maximum building height for Historic District non-

	<p>residential buildings is 40 ft</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Building shall be setback at least 4 feet from public right of ways, i.e. the North Main St right of way (ROW), and the Johns Rd and Rock St ROWs• Windows shall be rectangular, and account for at least 50% of the building front, from 2 ft to 8 ft above ground.• For new construction, building width shall not vary by more than 50% of the average width of nonresidential properties on the same block.• Masonry walls are preferred.• The maximum building footprint for C2-zoned properties is 12,000 square feet• Maximum impervious cover of 80 % for C2-zoned properties <p>REQUEST:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The applicant is requesting a certificate of appropriateness for a building addition that will connect 2 existing structures fully or partially located within the Historic District. Updates will include:<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Removal of an existing iron fence within the proposed area of work (Attachment 3, page 3)• Rework of an existing ramp within the proposed area of work on the first floor (Attachment 3, page 3)• Addition of a two-story bridge connector structure between the existing Saint Helena historic sanctuary and Wendler Hall buildings, described below:<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ The first story of the bridge connector structure consists of an open-air colonnade with a stone façade matching the stone used for the existing Saint Helena buildings. The colonnade spans and partially encloses:<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ A proposed patio of concrete pavers, an elevator connecting to the second story, and a new storage area attached to the Wendler Hall building. (Attachment 3, page 7)○ The second story of the structure is an enclosed building addition connecting the existing historic sanctuary and the second story deck of the Wendler Hall building. The site plan design includes men and women’s restrooms, a janitorial closet, and a hallway. (Attachment 3, page 9)○ The estimated building footprint of the new bridge
--	--

	<p>connection is between is between 800-900 square feet.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ No new parking spaces are proposed. <p>2. Additional notes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• There are several existing utility easements on the lot.• No water detention is proposed.• No trees will be impacted by the proposed building addition. <p>ANALYSIS:</p> <p>The Historic Landmark Commission must determine if the proposed building addition meets the requirements of section 2.11.B.5.e of the UDC prior to granting a certificate of appropriateness or building permit. The burden of proof rests with the applicant. Staff analysis of this project is presented below.</p> <p><u><i>Effect of the Proposed Change on Historical Cultural, and Architectural character</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The proposed changes are consistent with the Gothic Revival architectural character of the existing buildings, and would not change the cultural character of this portion of the Historic District. <p><u><i>Appropriateness of the exterior architectural features, which can be seen from a public street, alley, trail, or walkway</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The proposed changes are of appropriate height and massing, and do not exceed the 40 ft maximum building height requirement for non-residential buildings within the Historic District. They are also consistent with existing building setbacks along N Main St. <p><u><i>The general design, arrangement, materials, textures, and colors of the building or structure, and the relation of such factors to similar features of buildings and structures on the landmark site or in the historic district</i></u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The proposed design and materials of the first-floor colonnade appear to be consistent with the gothic revival style of the existing buildings, with the pointed gothic arches mirroring the arched entryway of the sanctuary. The exterior cladding material for the proposed connector appears to be matching the limestone stone used in the existing buildings. The proposed windows are diamond-patterned with casements, or casement
--	--

windows with rectangular panes. The windows are similar to the existing windows on the property, and meet the UDC requirement for rectangular-shaped windows in the Historic District. The proposed roof for the bridge extension appears to be a standing seam metal roof, which is consistent with the roofs of the existing buildings.

The extent to which any building, structure, or feature situated only partially within a historic district requires special provisions or considerations

- The Boerne Historic Design Guidelines, provisions and regulations contained in the UDC apply to all property which fully or partially within the locally designated Historic District.

Harmony with adjacent buildings and structures in terms of scale, height, and mass

- The proposed bridge connector would connect the existing sanctuary and Massey Hall buildings along N Main St, resulting in a wider, elongated front façade elevation with an estimated width of 172 feet, instead of two separate structures with frontage widths of 77 and 58 feet, respectively. The wider front façade of the connected St Helena buildings would be consistent with the estimated width of the front façade of the City Hall building (192 feet) across the street at 477 N Main, and would not exceed 50% of the average width of the buildings.

The value of the historic district or historic landmark as an area or site of unique interest and character, which should not be impaired.

- The proposed bridge connector would not alter the value of the historic district or impair the character of the existing Saint Helena landmark.

Additional considerations for C2 Zoned Properties:

- Properties with C2 zoning are allowed a maximum building footprint of 12,000 square feet per building.
- The proposed building connection would connect the existing historical sanctuary (footprint of 6936.5 square feet) and multi-purpose building (footprint of 6124.99 square feet) (Attachment 5), increasing the overall building footprint to approximately 14,000 square feet, including the footprint of the proposed connection (between 800-900 square feet).

- This proposed updated building footprint would exceed the maximum allowable building footprint of 12,000 square feet for C2 zoned properties, therefore, the applicant would have to apply for a variance with the Board of Adjustment or rezone the property prior to issuance of a building permit.
- The estimated impervious cover with the new bridge connector is approximately 50.2%, as per the applicant's representative, which is well below the maximum limit of 80% for C2 zoned properties.

CONCLUSION:

The scope of the proposed updates shown in the site plan for 410 N Main includes new construction on the site and the structural alteration of existing buildings on the site. These updates are beyond the scope of a certificate of appropriateness and require a building permit, as stated in Section 2.11.B.5.e of the UDC.

In addition, the proposed building connection would result in a total building footprint of approximately 14,000 square feet, which is greater than the maximum allowed in C2 zoned properties (12,000 square feet). This variance would have to be approved by the Board of Adjustment.

Therefore, it is recommended that the HLC conditionally approve the certificate of appropriateness request, conditional to:

1. Compliance with site elevation and landscape plans dated: 2/16/2024.
2. Approval of a variance request by the Board of Adjustment or a rezoning by the City Council.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Upon completion of a public hearing, the Commission may recommend to the Council that the application be: approved; approved with conditions; approved in part; denied; or denied in part.

MOTIONS FOR CONSIDERATION:

The following motions are provided to assist the Commission's decision.

- I move that the Historic Landmark Commission accept the findings and recommend that the City Council **APPROVE** the certificate of appropriateness for 410 N Main St (Saint Helena's Episcopal Church, subject to the two stipulations recommended by staff.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - I move that the Historic Landmark Commission DENIES the request for a certificate of appropriateness for 410 N Main St (Saint Helena's Episcopal Church. The Commission will need to state the reasons for the denial. These reasons should reference specific regulations in the UDC.
Item Justification	<div> <div> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Legal/Regulatory Obligation <input type="checkbox"/> Reduce Costs <input type="checkbox"/> Increase Revenue <input type="checkbox"/> Mitigate Risk <input type="checkbox"/> Master Plan Recommendation </div> <div> <input type="checkbox"/> Infrastructure Investment <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Customer Pull <input type="checkbox"/> Service Enhancement <input type="checkbox"/> Process Efficiency <input type="checkbox"/> Other: </div> </div>
Strategic Alignment	
Financial Considerations	N/A
Citizen Input/Board Review	
Legal Review	This action is a statutory requirement for building permit approval.
Alternative Options	<p>The Commission may recommend to the Council that the application be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approved; or • Approved with conditions; or • Approved in part; or • Denied; or • Denied in part.
Supporting Documents	<p>Attachment 1 – Site Map Attachment 2 – Street View Attachment 3 – Conceptual site plan Attachment 4 – Historic Survey Data Attachment 5 – Existing building footprint areas</p>