B	AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY
Agenda Date	November 7 <sup>th</sup> , 2024
Requested Action	Consider a certificate of appropriateness for a building permit request for the structure located at 723 N Main Street. The applicant is Mr. Fox (J. Fox Custom Fine Jewelry), Owner.
Contact Person	Sara Varvarigos, Planner II, Staff Liaison to the Historic Landmark Commission (830) 248-1630, <a href="mailto:svarvarigos@boerne-tx.gov">svarvarigos@boerne-tx.gov</a>
Case Number	2024-11-005B
Subject Property	723 N Main Street (commercial structure)
Background Information	<ul> <li>Historic District Status: The subject property is a noncontributing structure within the Historic District (Attachment 1 &amp;2).</li> <li>Applicant/owner: Jeff Fox (J. Fox Custom Fine Jewelry), Owner.</li> <li>Zoning: C3- Transitional Commercial, Historic Overlay District.</li> <li>REQUEST:</li> <li>The property owner is requesting:</li> <li>1. A certificate of appropriateness for a building permit to remove exterior stairs of the structure located at 723 N Main St. (Attachment 2).</li> <li>ANALYSIS &amp; FINDINGS:</li> <li>According to Historic District Survey records, the property located at 723 N Main St was built in 1983 in a Folk Victorian Revival Architectural style.</li> <li>The building features off-white clapboard siding with a standing seam metal roof in a copper green patina color. There are also tan and</li> </ul>

burgundy-toned accent colors on the structure (refer to attachment 2).

The southeastern façade of the building features exterior wooden stairs and a landing deck leading to an exterior attic access door and landing. The staircase also features metal and wooden guardrails (refer to attachment 2).

The stairs to the attic door landing deck are warped and leaning. Several of the boards on the landing deck appear to be warped, and the support posts may require structural reinforcement in order to meet City of Boerne Code Regulations. The applicant is requesting a certificate of appropriateness to remove the stairs, but still retain and reinforce the attic access landing.

The attic space contains an HVAC unit for the structure and does not include any livable space. This means that permanent exterior stairs to the attic are not required as per City of Boerne regulations, and the attic can be accessed using a ladder as needed.

The Historic Landmark Commission must determine if the proposed building update meets the requirements of section 2.11.B.5.e of the UDC (i.e. factors to be considered by the HLC before action on any application for a building permit or certificate of appropriateness within the Historic District). Staff analysis of the factors listed in section 2.11.B.5.e of the UDC is presented below.

#### <u>A. Effect of the Proposed Change on Historical, Cultural, and</u> Architectural character

 The proposed removal of exterior stairs on a non-historic Folk Victorian Architectural building would not impact the character of the district, since this is not a feature originally found in Folk Victorian buildings in the District.

## B. Appropriateness of the exterior architectural features, which can be seen from a public street, alley, trail, or walkway

 The existing exterior staircase and landing is not considered a historically appropriate feature for a Folk Victorian building.

C. The general design, arrangement, materials, textures, and colors of the building or structure, and the relation of such factors to similar features of buildings and structures on the landmark site or in the historic district

• The exterior staircase is not a consistent architectural feature for the Folk Victorian Revival style. A survey of neighboring Folk

Victorian and Queen Anne structures indicates that none of these buildings feature exterior staircase access to attic space. Removal is recommended.

 The proposed retention of the attic entry landing, with potential reinforcement of existing posts using a wood X brace, would create an increased visual impact on the southeastern facade. Removal of the existing attic landing structure (in addition to the staircase) is recommended instead.

# D. The extent to which any building, structure, or feature situated only partially within a historic district requires special provisions or considerations

- The Boerne Historic Design Guidelines, provisions and regulations contained in the UDC apply to all property which fully or partially within the locally designated Historic District.
- For buildings and structures that are less than fifty (50) years of age, which have been determined to be non-contributing, the historic landmark commission may apply the guidelines with more flexibility.
- In reviewing work affecting non-historic buildings, the historic landmark commission's approach is to maintain or enhance their relationship and compatibility with adjacent historic buildings and streetscape.

### E. Harmony with adjacent buildings and structures in terms of scale, height, and mass

- The existing staircase and landing visually dominates the view of the southeastern facade as seen from Main St, and the neighboring Daniel A. Foote House, which is a local City of Boerne Historic Landmark.
- Removing the exterior stairs and landing deck, which are not considered historically appropriate features, would result in a more streamlined southeast elevation of the structure. It would also reinforce the harmony of the building in relation to the neighboring Daniel A. Foote House, as well as nearby historic structures.

### <u>F. The value of the historic district or historic landmark as an area or site</u> of unique interest and character, which should not be impaired.

The proposed exterior staircase and landing removal would not

alter the value of the historic district, and would reinforce architectural consistency with other Folk Victorian structures located within the district. STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends removing the stairs, landing deck, and guardrails along southeastern elevation, as per staff findings in previous section. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission **APPROVE** the requested: 1. A certificate of appropriateness for a building permit to remove exterior stairs, landing, and wood and metal guardrails of the structure located at 723 N Main St. (Attachment 2). MOTIONS FOR CONSIDERATION: The following motions are provided to assist the Commission's decision. I move that the Historic Landmark Commission accept staff findings and **APPROVE** 1. A certificate of appropriateness for a building permit to remove exterior stairs, landing, and wood and metal guardrails for the structure located at 723 N Main St. (Attachment 2). OR I move that the Historic Landmark Commission reject the findings and DENY 1. A certificate of appropriateness for a building permit to remove exterior stairs, landing, and wood and metal guardrails for the structure located at 723 N Main St. (Attachment 2). (The Commission will need to state the reasons for the denial. These reasons should reference specific regulations in the UDC). Item Justification [ ] Legal/Regulatory Obligation [ ] Infrastructure Investment [ ] Reduce Costs [X] Customer Pull [ ] Increase Revenue [ ] Service Enhancement [ ] Mitigate Risk [ ] Process Efficiency [ ] Master Plan Recommendation [ ] Other:

Strategic Alignment	C2 – Seeking customer-driven feedback. C3 – Collaborate with community partners to enhance quality of life.
Financial Considerations	N/A
Citizen Input/Board Review	N/A
Legal Review	Section 3.11 of the UDC requires the review of any building permit for exterior improvements for structures located within the Historic District.
Alternative Options	<ul> <li>The Commission may consider the request for roof permit:</li> <li>Approved; or</li> <li>Approved with conditions; or</li> <li>Denied; or</li> <li>Denied in part.</li> </ul>
Supporting Documents	Attachment 1 – Location Map Attachment 2 – Street View and Existing Stairs